

Embracing cultural diversity in the classroom

Building an intercultural school's programme

Research and development report

Edited by Jenny Siung, Chester Beatty, and Jo-Anne Sunderland Bowe, Heritec



Contents

Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 1	3
Setting the scene	3
Partners	5
Definitions	7
Summary of past policies, papers, projects and strategies influencing this project	9
Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 2	15
Project aims and objectives	15
Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 3	17
Analysis of current practices	17
Analysis of case studies	27
Selected Case studies: summary	28
Emerging themes	34
What might an intercultural school's programme in a museum look like?	34
Overview	34
Project deliverables	34
Recommendations	34
Methodologies, methods and learning outcomes	35
Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 4	40
Programme development	40
Introduction	40
Tours	40
Training for volunteers	41
Continuous Professional Development (CPD)	42
Evaluation	44
Pilot gallery tours: children's voice	46
Online learning resources	47
Outcomes	47
Conclusion	47
Appendix 1	
Chester Beatty Guided Tours Framework developed by project partners	48
Appendix 2	50
Appendix 3	51
Selected Bibliography	52
Credits	54

Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 1

Setting the scene

Introduction

The Chester Beatty's Learning and Education Department offers a wide range of ways to learn about and engage with the Collections. Through our vibrant and exciting programme of events and professional training for teachers, educators and creatives, we offer opportunities to explore world cultures, as found in Chester's Beatty's Islamic, East Asian and European Collections. Intercultural dialogue and learning play a key role in the museum's mission and fosters dialogue with the communities as represented in the museum.

The Learning and Education Department has worked for several years exploring ways to engage primary and post-primary schools and teachers with this unique Collection, and initiated an 18-month project to research, develop and build its first intercultural school's programme (2018–2020). As part of this process, the Chester Beatty invited the largest teaching colleges in Ireland – Mary Immaculate, Limerick; Maynooth University; the Intercultural Education Service (Education Authority of Northern Ireland); and UK Heritec Education Consultancy – to partner and develop the programme.

This document includes the background to the intercultural school's project; definitions on intercultural dialogue and relevant policies, strategies and projects in both the formal education, arts and cultural sectors; the development of the intercultural school's programme; analysis of current practices and methodologies; programme development including the training of volunteer guides, Continuous Professional Development of teachers, pilot tours and evaluation.

The Chester Beatty Library, © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Back to contents

Background to the intercultural school's programme in the Chester Beatty

In the last 20 years the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland have experienced a rapid rise in immigration. Consequently, the education systems in both jurisdictions now face the challenge and opportunity of acknowledging and including increasing numbers of pupils of diverse cultures, languages and outlooks.

Key steps in developing an intercultural school's programme in the Chester Beatty

The steps followed in developing the programme were set out at the onset of the project as follows: To research, develop and launch an innovative school's programme that both enhances human rights and equality and promotes intercultural understanding and diversity using the Chester Beatty's Islamic, East Asian and European Collections.

In line with the changing Irish curriculum, for the Chester Beatty to help build organisational capacity and offer a unique opportunity for the first Continuous Professional Development (CPD) on intercultural understanding and diversity for teachers, using our globally focused Collections; and incorporate curriculum reform identified by the Department of Education and Skills, which includes the introduction of STEAM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Art and Maths) in the Junior Cycle and Leaving Certificate.

To create digital resources that enhance both on-site and online education activities, and to create access by making them available to wider audiences by breaking physical, intellectual and geographical barriers often experienced by the museum and education sectors.

To create cross-border dialogue; exchange good practice for teachers in cultural diversity in the classroom; and address the gap that exists in CPD in intercultural dialogue for teachers in the Republic of Ireland.

Partners

Chester Beatty

Described by Lonely Planet as "not just the best museum in Ireland but one of the best in Europe", the Chester Beatty is the pre-eminent Irish museum promoting the appreciation and understanding of world cultures with holdings of manuscripts, rare books, and other treasures from Europe, the Middle East, North Africa and Asia. An engaging and welcoming space, visitors from Ireland and overseas will find permanent and temporary displays, an intercultural learning programme and a broad variety of public activities for all ages and backgrounds.

Heritec UK

Heritec is a small heritage education consultancy, providing services to the heritage sector specifically around the areas of audience development, public engagement, cocurated exhibitions, training and evaluation. Heritec provides organisations with the tools to help organisations develop and deliver their programmes via resource development, workshop development, event management planning, outreach, co-curated exhibitions, evaluation, training and development of staff and volunteers. Heritec provides support for research, evaluation and audience consultation projects using amongst others the *Inspiring Learning for All* framework and the Generic Learning Outcomes and other appropriate methodologies as identified by the need of the project and audience. Heritec advises institutions on how audiences can engage with and learn from the collections, putting Object-Based Learning at the core of its methodology.

Intercultural Education Service (IES) Northern Ireland

The Intercultural Education Service helps schools to meet the additional educational needs of pupils from its target communities: Traveller; Newcomer; Asylum-Seekers; Refugees and Roma. The IES helps with all aspects of a child's journey through education, including: admission to preschool; getting transport to school; changing schools; to moving through primary and post-primary education. The Service also helps with Newcomer issues, special educational needs and providing support whenever a child or parent needs it.

Mary Immaculate College, Limerick

Founded in 1898, Mary Immaculate College (Irish: *Coláiste Mhuire gan Smál*) is a Catholic College of Education and the Liberal Arts. It became academically linked to the University of Limerick in 1991 and all degrees, certificates and other educational awards offered at the college are accredited by the university. Mary Immaculate College is the coordinating partner of *The Enquiring Classroom* project.

Maynooth University

The National University of Ireland, Maynooth (Irish: *Ollscoil na hÉireann Má Nuad*) – commonly known as Maynooth University – is a constituent university of the National University of Ireland in Maynooth, County Kildare.. It is Ireland's youngest university, having been founded by the Universities Act (1997) from the secular faculties of the now separate St Patrick's College, Maynooth, which was founded in 1795. Maynooth University is the coordinating partner of *The Enquiring Classroom* project.

Definitions

Overview

As part of the research and contributions of partners, a number of definitions pertaining to this project have been collated to illustrate current understanding of intercultural dialogue in the museum and education sectors in Ireland today. There are several interpretations of these definitions and interpretations may differ for museum and cultural heritage professionals, when compared to a group of teachers. The following definitions reflect current policies and practices understood by both sectors in Ireland and internationally.

Intercultural dialogue in the museum sector

Intercultural dialogue is a process that comprises an open and respectful exchange of interaction between individuals, groups and organisations with diverse cultural backgrounds or world views. Among its aims are:

- To develop a deeper understanding of diverse perspectives and practices;
- To increase participation and the freedom and ability to make choices;
- To foster equality;
- And to enhance the creative process.¹

Intercultural education is defined by the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment

Intercultural education has two focal points: It is education which respects, celebrates and recognises the normality of diversity in all areas of human life. It sensitises the learner to the idea that humans have naturally developed a range of different ways of life, customs and world views, and that this breadth of human life enriches all of us. It is education that promotes equality and human rights, challenges unfair discrimination, and promotes the values upon which equality is built.²

Cultural diversity

Cultural diversity is the existence of a variety of diverse groups in society. These groups can share a number of characteristics including culture, religion, ethnicity, language, religion, sexual orientation, class, gender, amongst other things.³

¹ Bodo, S., Gibbs, K. and Sani, M., eds. (2009). *Museums as Places for Intercultural Dialogue:* selected practices from Europe, Map for ID Group, p.6.

² National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2005). *Intercultural Education in the Primary* School – Guidelines for schools, Dublin: National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, p.3.

³ See UNESCO for definition on Cultural Diversity <u>https://en.unesco.org/themes/education-</u> sustainable-development/cultural-diversity

Intercultural competence

Intercultural competence is the ability to develop targeted knowledge, skills and attitudes that lead to visible behaviour and communication that are both effective and appropriate in intercultural interactions.⁴

Intercultural attitude

Intercultural attitude concerns people, but also organisations, associations, businesses, cultural institutions, museums, libraries, archives, community centres and so on.⁵

Intercultural organisation

An intercultural organisation does not only allow people from other cultures to develop their artistic practices. It also allows for the questioning of practices and professional cultures, and the criticism of inherited logic, habits, and specific values, which often stand in the way of working together and create unnecessary competition. Being intercultural means questioning the content of what one transmits, the work of art one puts up for display, and the memories and stories that education favours or disregards.⁶

⁴ Deardoff, D.K. (2006). The Identification and Assessment of Intercultural Competence as a Student Outcome of Internationalisation at Institutions of Higher Education in the United States, *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 10, pp.241-266.

⁵ Open Method of Coordination (OMC) (2014). *The role of public arts and cultural institutions in the promotion of cultural diversity and intercultural dialogue*, Brussels: European Union.

⁶ Ibid.

Summary of past policies, papers, projects and strategies influencing this project

Overview

The population of Ireland has changed and negotiating multiple identities, however, the formal education sector has been slow to respond and reflect cultural diversity in both curricula and staff. The Migrant Teachers project in Marino Institute of Education was established in 2017 and aims to increase the participation of Immigrant Internationally Educated Teachers (IIETs) in Irish primary and post-primary schools.⁷ The National Council for Curriculum and Assessment is adapting primary and post-primary curricula to meet this change. While Ireland has traditionally experienced emigration resulting in a large Irish Diaspora, the country experienced an unprecedented wave of returning Irish migrants, as well as significant European and international immigrants, during the Celtic Tiger⁸ years of 1995–2007. The Irish government has been slow to develop policies relating to immigration and integration.⁹ Currently there are 182 languages spoken in Ireland, yet there are very few resources available within the Irish education system to support these new languages and newcomer children.¹⁰ With immigration to Ireland, ethnic segregation is also a recent feature in Irish schools.¹¹ However, over the course of the Celtic Tiger years, a number of State organisations researched and established responses to the changing profile of the Irish population in the Republic of Ireland.

Policies

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA)

The National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) is a statutory body of the Department of Education and Skills. It advises the Minister of Education and Skills on curriculum and assessment for early childhood education, primary and postprimary schools, as well as assessment procedures used in schools and examinations on subjects which are part of the curriculum.¹² This is achieved through research, deliberation, consultation and networks.

The NCCA published guidelines for primary schools in the Republic of Ireland in 2005. It states two key focal points to define intercultural education as follows:

⁷ See <u>https://www.mie.ie/en/research/migrant_teacher_project/</u>

⁸ The Celtic Tiger was a period of rapid economic growth from 1995–2007 in Ireland.

⁹ Siung, Jennifer, 2009, Thoughtful and respectful engagement: intercultural dialogue and the Chester Beatty Library, Ireland, in Bodo, Simona, Gibbs, Kirsten, Sani, Margherita (eds) Museums as places for intercultural dialogue: selected practices from Europe, Map for ID, A Lifelong Learning Project published for the European Union, p. 19.

¹⁰ Duncan, Pamela, Pollak, Sorcha, CSO Figures Show 182 Languages are Spoken in State's Homes, The Irish Times, 2 June 2015, Dublin.

¹¹ Duncan, Pamela, Humphreys, Joe, 'Census Figures Raise Concerns of Ethnic Segregation in Schools', *The Irish Times*, 24 February 2015, Dublin.

¹² See National Council for Curriculum and Assessment <u>https://www.ncca.ie/en/about/about-ncca/</u> what-we-do

"It is education which respects, celebrates and recognises the normality of diversity in all areas of human life. It sensitises the learner to the idea that humans have naturally developed a range of different ways of life, customs and worldviews, and that this breadth of human life enriches all of us. It is education, which promotes equality and human rights, challenges unfair discrimination, and promotes the values upon which equality is built."¹³

Department of Education and Skills (DES)

The Department of Education and Skills (DES) is a department of the Irish State with responsibility for education and training. The mission of the DES is to facilitate individuals in learning to achieve their full potential and contribute to Ireland's social, cultural and economic development.¹⁴ The DES launched the *Intercultural Education Strategy 2010–2015* and aims to ensure that:

- All students experience an education that "respects the diversity of values, beliefs, languages and traditions in Irish society and is conducted in a spirit of partnership" (Education Act, 1998).
- All education providers are assisted with ensuring that inclusion and integration become the norm within an intercultural learning environment.

The Strategy was developed in recognition of the recent significant demographic changes in Irish society, which are reflected in the education system. It builds on existing work in this area and seeks to be of relevance for all sectors of education, in line with the high-level goal of the DES to "support and improve the quality, relevance and inclusiveness of education for every learner in our schools".¹⁵

White papers

The Council of Europe White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue

The Council of Europe's core objective is the promotion of intercultural dialogue in Europe, while preserving and promoting human rights, democracy and the rule of law, in acknowledgement of Europe's rich diversity and that tolerance ensures an open society. A series of European ministerial meetings were held. The first summit took place in 1993 and a Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities was held in 1995. Both events led to a number of frameworks, campaigns and initiatives, including the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) and the launch of the European Youth Campaign against racism, anti-Semitism, xenophobia and intolerance. *All Different All Equal* is an education resource produced by the Council of Europe as a result. This led to a decision to draw up a *White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue* within and between societies in Europe and dialogue between Europe and its neighbours in 2008.¹⁶

¹³ Op. Cit. No.2, p.3.

¹⁴ See The Department of Education and Skills: <u>https://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/</u>

¹⁵ Department of Education and Skills and the Office of Integration (2010). *Intercultural Education Strategy 2010-2015*, Dublin: Department of Education and Skills.

¹⁶ Council of Europe (2008). *White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue, Living Together as Equals in Dignity*, Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing.

The Council of Europe recognises the importance of managing Europe's increasing cultural diversity. The *White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue* strives for the democratic governance of cultural diversity to be adapted in many aspects; democratic citizenship and participation should be strengthened; intercultural competences should be taught and learned; spaces for intercultural dialogue should be created and widened; and intercultural dialogue should be taken to the international level.¹⁷

Open Method of Coordination

The European Union agenda towards Culture 2020 commissioned a series of exchanges on topics of common interest for EU Member States to promote mutual learning and cooperation. One such exchange is through the Open Method of Coordination (OMC), a voluntary cooperation among Member States. The EU Council work plan for 2011–2014 identified a number of priorities including cultural diversity, intercultural dialogue and accessible and inclusive culture. Experts are invited to mainly represent the Ministries of Arts and Culture, in order to identify policies and good practices of public arts and cultural institutions that promote better access to wider cultural participation.

Three key reports reflect the role of arts and culture and their role to include intercultural dialogue and inclusion as a priority for EU Member States. The following reports all include the right for people to access arts and culture, with particular recognition of culturally diverse groups. Intercultural dialogue is recognised as an essential aspect in the role of arts and cultural institutions when engaging with diverse audiences. The Chester Beatty represented the (then) Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht and contributed to the following reports:

- Report on Policies and Good Practices in the Public Arts and in Cultural Institutions (2012)
- Report on the Role of Public Arts and Cultural Institutions in the Promotion of Cultural Diversity and Intercultural Dialogue (2014)
- Cultural Awareness and Expression Handbook (2015)

Strategies

Arts Council of Ireland

The Arts Council of Ireland developed a Strategic Plan 2011–2013 whereby cultural diversity is referred to in their overall strategy. In 2010, they launched their *Cultural Diversity in the Arts* policy. Within the context of this policy, the Arts Council of Ireland states the following:

"This is intended as a resource for the arts sector and other relevant parties, and as a means of informing and enriching public discourse about culturally diverse interaction, collaboration and experimentation in the arts, based on shared understandings of relevant terms.

17 Ibid. p.4.

- The introduction of a specific cultural diversity strand to the Local Partnership Scheme in order to foster intercultural capacity at local and national level through strategic collaboration among local authorities and with arts and non-arts organisations.
- The piloting of a cultural diversity audit on selected Arts Council schemes." 18

Arts Council of Northern Ireland

The Arts Council of Northern Ireland developed an Intercultural Arts Strategy (2011–2016) in response to their five-year strategy. It seeks to foster the expression of cultural pluralism, build dialogue, and promote understanding, through interchanges within and between communities and their cultures.¹⁹ The Intercultural Arts Strategy aims to harness the arts to promote social cohesion and address racism.

Legacy projects

Museums as places for intercultural dialogue (Map for ID) (2007–2010) / LEM Working Group on Intercultural dialogue (2011–present)

The aim of *Map for ID* was to research the current understanding and practice of intercultural dialogue in European museums; to provide insights, reflections and learning points raised from the process; provide a brief description of 30 pilot projects, create guidelines based on this work and disseminate in Europe as well as internationally.²⁰ The topic of intercultural dialogue in museums was extended in a follow-up project the *Learning Museum* (LEM) which is currently a pan-European working group and network of museum professionals dedicated to policies and practice in museum learning.

Ways of Seeing I and Ways of Seeing II (2012-2015)

Very few learning resources, training or support exists for trainee teachers and teachers in the Irish education system, despite the profile of children in Irish schools becoming more culturally diverse. The Chester Beatty teamed up with the Intercultural Education Services (IES) of Northern Ireland to develop a series of learning resources. *Ways of Seeing I* and *II* were launched in 2012 and 2015 in Northern Ireland. Both resources provide teachers with cross-curricular approaches to teaching, and support language skills and world faiths. Teachers from the IES were actively involved in the development of these resources with the Education Staff of the Ulster Museum (Belfast, Northern Ireland) and the Chester Beatty, which is designed to introduce teachers to cultural diversity through museum collections and themes found in the curriculum such as world faiths, science, art, maths, literacy, language skills, science, history and geography.²¹

¹⁸ The Arts Council of Ireland (2009). *Cultural Diversity and the Arts, Language and Meanings,* Dublin: The Arts Council Ireland.

¹⁹ Arts Council of Northern Ireland (2012). *Intercultural Arts Strategy*, Executive Summary, Belfast: Arts Council of Northern Ireland.

²⁰ Bodo, S., Gibbs, K. and Sani, M. eds. (2009). *Museums as Places for Intercultural Dialogue:* selected practices from Europe, Map for ID.

²¹ Intercultural Education Services, Armagh (2012). *Ways of Seeing I* and Chester Beatty Library, Dublin (2015). *Ways of Seeing II*. See: <u>https://chesterbeatty.ie/learning/resources-for-educators/</u>

The Enquiring Classroom (2016–2019)

The Enquiring Classroom has developed an innovative model of enquiry-based learning in order to facilitate meaningful, open, responsible, and respectful discussion and debate about complex ethical, social and religious issues in classrooms. Its novelty stems from its integration of best practice in philosophy for and with children; experiential and interpretative approaches to education about religions, beliefs and ethics; and creative arts-based methodologies. It adopts this pluralistic methodological approach in order to establish communities of enquiry in classrooms. Communities of enquiry cultivate and develop the cognitive, affective and social competences required for intercultural, civic, philosophical and ethical dialogue. This project optimises opportunities for participation, active engagement of all students ensuring maximal inclusion, in particular students from refugee or asylum seeker backgrounds and students who may feel alienated from or dissent from dominant norms and values in society.²²

The Development and Intercultural Education (DICE) project

The Development and Intercultural Education (DICE) project is a national education initiative, which promotes the integration of development and intercultural education in initial teacher education at primary level in Ireland. DICE works to support teacher educators and student teachers to integrate global and intercultural perspectives and themes into their teaching practice. By targeting the skills, knowledge and values of people involved in education, DICE seeks to promote global solidarity, human rights and sustainable development, and support people to recognise and challenge discrimination and inequality, both locally and globally.

Sharing Inclusive Practice Network

The Sharing Inclusive Practice Network was initiated by the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA). It brought schools together from a range of different perspectives in order to talk about questions of values and ethics that arose from the NCCA consultation process on the Education about Religions and Beliefs (ERB) and Ethics curriculum. The interesting dimension to this project was that there was no pressure for consensus and no imposed framework. It operated in a bottom-up way, as a community of practice that, through dialogue, identified the key themes for discussion. In this way, it was a space for dialogue and listening that fostered openness and collegiality, allowing schools to express and reflect on the different values and principles that shapes life in their schools.

Maintaining Intercultural Education Competencies Project MICEP (2016–2020)

The aim of the *Maintaining Intercultural Education Competencies Project* is to develop intercultural competencies and capacity in teaching and learning across higher education institutions. Intercultural competencies are those knowledge, skills and attitudes that comprise a person's ability to get along with, work and learn with people from diverse cultures. The project seeks to complement other initiatives

²² Ref: The Enquiring Classroom www.enquiring-project.eu

already underway at a local, national and European level. The five partner institutions involved are working together to develop the intercultural competence of Higher Education Authority (HEA) staff and students through the development of a module and embedding the teaching of intercultural competence within Higher Education Institution's programmes. This project targets both students and staff, and formal curricular content, to embed intercultural competence in education programmes. The project aims to support the development of intercultural competencies for students and professionals in the fields of education, training and social intervention. It also aims to share and transfer innovative practices and innovative approaches to facilitate the development and implementation of diversity sensitive projects.

Working collaboratively; working cross-sector

Overview

Since its foundation, the Chester Beatty has provided an educative role through research, exhibitions, talks and a wide range of activities. The museum has an indispensable role to play in developing mutual understanding and respect among all people on our island, as explicitly stated in our Mission. The Chester Beatty *Learning Policy* places learning at the heart of its programmes and aims to embed core values of learning, intercultural dialogue, creativity and well-being, both onsite and off-site. It achieves this by addressing the needs of the museum's culturally-diverse audiences of all ages, through engagement with the cultural, religious, geographic, historic, scientific and artistic aspects of the Collection.²³

Since 2002, the Chester Beatty has encouraged creative collaborations with local partners to co-develop programmes and new learning interpretations of its Collections for audiences, including teachers and students. The museum understands the importance of these partnerships and invited experts from the formal education sector to develop and implement an onsite programme for children and young people under the age of 18. Through strategic partnerships with the formal education sector, the intercultural school's project aims to raise awareness, provide training for teachers and deliver sustainable learning resources that can be shared with schools to inspire and support intercultural learning as reflected in the culturally-diverse populations that now exist in Irish schools and communities.

²³ Chester Beatty Library (2019). *Chester Beatty Learning Policy*, Dublin: Chester Beatty Library. See: https://chesterbeatty.ie/assets/uploads/2018/10/Learning-Policy.pdf

Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 2

Project aims and objectives

What do we mean by an intercultural museum programme for schools?

Support for primary, post-primary and continuous education

A key function of the Chester Beatty Learning and Education Department is to support formal education in Ireland. It recognises the changing curricula in Irish primary and post-primary schools, as well as the presence of cultural diversity in the classroom. The new school's programme includes:

- Online Collection-based learning resources, with special focus on art and design for the Junior Cycle and Leaving Certificate.
- On-site educational visits, facilitated by volunteer guides, utilising creative and critical thinking skills.
- Continuous professional development for primary and post-primary teachers and educators.
- Online Collection-based learning resources for language support, science, technology, engineering, art and maths (STEAM), and world faiths.

Supporting teachers, educators and developing the curriculum through continuous professional development

A key component of our work in the Chester Beatty is to provide continuous professional development for teachers, trainee teachers, educators and creative innovators. Our work aims to raise awareness of the Chester Beatty's programmes, learning resources and projects that help to develop new ways of teaching and using the Collections.

- The Learning and Education Department offers continuous professional development both in-house, off-site and online.
- We partner with formal and informal education partners to design and deliver training with focus on cultural diversity, creativity, innovation and critical thinking skills.

Research phase

Overview

An initial research phase at the beginning of the project was designed to explore the current 'state' of intercultural education in the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland. During the research phase, project partners contributed case studies and examples of projects, policies and strategies, some of which were cited in the first section. The purpose of the search phase was to gather information, in order to prepare for the development of the project output.

Research questions

The research phase was defined by the following question:

- What can a museum offer to support intercultural education in Ireland through its programme for schools?

This was supported by the following supplementary questions:

- 1. What is the link between the case studies from the education sector and the museum sector?
- 2. What can a museum offer to support intercultural education in Ireland through its school's programme?
- 3. What is the current situation of intercultural education in Irish education?
- 4. What are the common features of delivery of intercultural education?
- 5. What is the purpose of intercultural education?
- 6. What tools are used in the delivery of intercultural education?
- 7. What topics are discussed or covered in intercultural education?
- 8. How does this reflect on what a museum can offer through its school's programmes?

Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 3

Analysis of current practices

The case studies included have been collected and submitted by each partner and provide a snapshot of activity across the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland and the rest of the UK. These case studies and examples provide an overview of the current practice in intercultural learning and dialogue in early childhood, primary and post-primary schools as well as the Irish and UK museum sectors. These examples enable us to assess current attitudes and pinpoint types of projects and activities. They are a snapshot, and by no means exhaustive, and have helped steer the design of new guided tours, gallery trails, CPD and online learning resources as the Chester Beatty's tentative step towards developing a school's programme.

Overview

The analysis is provided via contributions from our project partners. This includes an overview of the work, research and insights each of the partners brought to the project during the course of the 18 months.

1. Clodagh Daly of the Intercultural Education Service explains the role and types of support of their organisation in the context of primary and post-primary schools in Northern Ireland;

2. Prof Aislinn O'Donnell reflects on culturally responsive and sustaining pedagogies, particularly in the context of their research in the academic field of intercultural dialogue and education in Ireland;

3. Dr Patricia Kieran provides an overview of current practice in intercultural education and the overlap with development education in Ireland;

4. Jenny Siung provides an analysis of intercultural education currently offered by museums in Ireland and Northern Ireland.

Analysis of current offer in early childhood, primary and post-primary schools in Ireland and Northern Ireland: Current offer in early childhood, primary and postprimary schools in Northern Ireland

Clodagh Daly, Intercultural Education Service, Northern Ireland

This summary provides an overview of the support available from the Education Authority, yet it is not exhaustive. The service responsible for supporting schools with Newcomer pupils is the Intercultural Education Service (IES) within the Education Authority. The IES supports schools in the following areas: Intercultural Awareness; Welcome and Communication with home; Assessment and Planning, using the Common European Framework of Reference and Curriculum Access.

- *Ways of Seeing I*: This is a resource designed to promote inclusive practice in schools, museums and other educational institutions and promote intercultural awareness, language learning, the use of home languages and bilingualism.

- *Ways of Seeing II*: This resource provides teachers and pupils with resources and frameworks that explore diverse faiths and cultures: Islam, Christianity, Judaism, Hinduism, Buddhism and ancient Egyptian culture.

In addition to resources available on its webpages, IES also provides support to schools through:

- Two online courses (one primary and one post-primary), which are accredited by Queen's University, Belfast. The first unit within each course encourages staff in schools to examine current practice and consider ways in which their school environment, everyday practice and teaching might be improved to become more inclusive. This is a theme that runs through subsequent units.
- The Schools of Sanctuary Award: The award and the school development process leading up to the award, is aimed at helping schools to develop further the concept that schools are welcoming places for pupils and their families, where every child feels safe and is fully accepted. These schools will become beacons in the community as places where cultural diversity is valued and celebrated.
- School visits and cluster meetings to support schools in implementing the learning taken from resources, cluster meetings and courses.

Currently three other services within the Education Authority are working on a focused programme with the Intercultural Education Service to promote more inclusive practices in schools:

- The Youth Service: This service is working with identified and targeted groups in and out of school to promote the inclusion of all cultures. It also aims to develop a community relations style programme across cultural groupings to promote acceptance of others, test values and beliefs and promote a sense of belonging to the school.
- 2. Community Relations, Equality and Diversity (CRED): The main thrust of the CRED programme is to improve relations between communities in formal and non-formal education settings. It supports schools to provide children and young people with opportunities to build relationships with those of different backgrounds and traditions within the resources available and to develop self-respect and respect for others/otherness.
- 3. The School Development Service (SDS): SDS delivers strategic support and challenge to school principals, Boards of Governors and school staff in order to ensure that standards are raised and education outcomes for all children and young people are improved.

The Education Authority and IES also work closely with other agencies such as local councils, health and voluntary agencies.

Culturally responsive and sustaining pedagogies

Prof Aislinn O'Donnell, Head of Department of Education, Maynooth University

The genesis of the language of interculturalism was an effort to challenge and thus open up what had become framed as a monolithic 'billiard ball model' of multiculturalism, whereby cultures were seen as homogenous, bounded and mutually exclusive; what Amartya Sen has called "plural monoculturalism".²⁴ This critique was not universally accepted. Through his writings, Paul Gilroy emphasises that this image of 'multi-culture' is a caricature of the complex internal and relational dynamics of heterogeneous cultures, and presupposes a racialised standard or norm of purportedly liberal democratic society that diversity and multi-culture are alleged to threaten.²⁵ This oppositional discourse between liberal democracy and multiculturalism today has witnessed a resurgence in the form of narrow varieties of ethno-nationalism that present cultural diversity as a problem or a threat, and claims that 'diversity talk' promotes a kind of cultural relativism that leaves *us* without a critical anchor to judge regressive and oppressive practices. What is thus required is not integration but assimilation, it is said. Gilroy has called this desire "post-colonial melancholia". He instead asks us to pay attention to the complexity of our identities and the ordinary forms of conviviality that characterise much of human life, as well as the deep solidarities that we find whenever we look more deeply into human affairs.

Other criticisms of intercultural education suggest that it has, at times, relied on superficial – even stereotyped – approaches to the question of difference by focusing on celebration rather than engaging with the complexity of what it means for humans to live together. It is said that intercultural education has not always sufficiently dealt with the historical legacies of racism and colonialism that persist through images and preconceptions of what the 'norm' is, for example, who is 'really' Irish and who counts as 'diverse'. This happens when 'difference' is gazed upon and constructed through the lens of a single dominant culture. James Tully's work, *Strange Multiplicity*, undoes the baldness of these monolithic ways of seeing and describes ways in which a genuinely multicultural democracy might create the conditions for real participation and genuine inclusion of a range of diverse voices alongside a sensitivity to the cross-cutting nature of different affiliations, commonalities and difference: a far more entangled vision.²⁶ Yet interculturalism and intercultural education have, despite these criticisms, always been attentive to the encounter, to exchange, to transformation, and to relation. The 'inter' marks the 'between' or 'liminal' space of dialogue, of learning, and of difference.

Monoculture, monologues, and monologics pose a considerable threat in today's global context. But these claims to fixed and bounded identity are, as museum collections teach us, based on fantasy and myths of uncontaminated purity and origins. It is important that intercultural educators are sensitive to wider social tendencies that risk people entrenching themselves in their own territories and identities – in monologues that cannot hear the other or see the other as a threat, and in myths of purity and origins. Philosophical enquiry into the origins of metaphysical concepts, like identity, can help to create safe spaces for the critical exploration of difficult ideas and concepts. Intercultural education can develop indirect pedagogical strategies in order to create the conditions for spaces of encounter that are not didactic or moralising.

²⁴ Sen, A. (2006). *Identity and Violence, The Illusion of Destiny*, London: Penguin Random House.

²⁵ Gilroy, P. (2004). After Empire: Melancholia or Convivial Culture?, Oxfordshire: Routledge Classics.

²⁶ Tully, J. (1995). *Strange Multiplicity, Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Another way of thinking about the question of interculturalism – and thus intercultural education - is to see that exchange, relation, sharing, communication, movement, and migration have been at the heart of the human condition since the earliest humans. This does not mean describing discrete identities who then encounter one another, or viewing encounters with difference and diversity through a strengths-based lens. It involves seeing that the human condition itself begins in relation and exchange. Instead of focusing on identity, the focus turn to the internal complexity and relational nature and qualities of cultures – in particular, material cultures – rather than centring first on persons as expressions of – or embodying – cultures. This also helps to shift the language of intercultural education from one of seeking mutual understanding, to one that preserves – as Édouard Glissant says – the "right to opacity" of the other that creates a space for exploration of cultures in ways that remain respectful of others and preserves the specificity of cultures.²⁷ This counters some of the risks in some iterations of intercultural education that presume a child or young person possesses a given culture (and generally this is only one culture which adds additional complexity when trying to navigate multiple heritages and ethnic belongings) because they have certain ethnic or cultural characteristics. Instead, we start with material cultures, as we find in museums, approached as shared human heritage. This can serve to open up the possibility for some students to discuss their own connections to different cultural traditions (including religious and belief traditions) if they wish, as well as to encounter objects, rituals, beliefs, practices, imaginings, and ways of existing in other traditions and within their own traditions. By beginning with the material manifestations of cultures, this can create sensitivity to relation and encounter that is supported by tracking the journeys of all kinds of things (objects, artefacts, maps, prayers, gestures, patterns, ideas, fashions, symbols, inventions); we begin with movement, with migration, with journeying, with exchange, with communication. This is not reductive, and it does not seek to make all cultures fundamentally the same, but it provokes a spirit of curiosity, interest and enquiry that enables children and young people to make distinctions – locate commonalities - and accept that there are things one may never understand at the deepest level. It does not involve seeking mutual understanding or empathy, but rather creates an atmosphere in which – despite not understanding the other - I can still be with them, live with them, and learn from them, including past cultures and diverse religious traditions. There is a risk in tying tolerance of difference to understanding the other. Perhaps it is that which I do not understand and may can never understand that I need to stay with. This is what coexistence means, and that may also keep our relation of difference alive; can we really imagine the world of the weighing of the soul in Ancient Egypt?

The *Embracing Cultural Diversity in the Classroom* project involves living with, being moved by, and even being changed by that which we cannot understand, as well as that which invites us to imagine otherwise. This is not framed as a moral imperative that we 'ought' to listen to. It entails telling stories, perhaps beginning with imagining some of the earliest humans as we know them today, through the material remains of their cultures and other early cultures from thousands of years ago to today, or a thousand

²⁷ Callaloo, vol. 36, no. 4, Special Issue: Édouard Glissant (Fall, 2013), The Johns Hopkins University Press, pp.875-889.

years in the future when others may study our remains and imagine us. This undoes a progressive approach to history that presents humans as at various stages on the path to civilisation, cultivating instead a sense of humility and interest. Educational spaces might then involve accepting that often we do not and cannot understand others or ourselves, and yet we can coexist in relation. The right to opacity does not preclude us learning to experiment with pedagogies that open us to the world and the world to us. We can have solidarity without sameness.

The mediating objects, collections and spaces of museums invite children, young people and educators to suspend, however temporarily, their fixed notions of identity. Even where collections are of different traditions that some people may have more affinity with than others, this does not preclude others from encounters with the internal complexities of those traditions, especially if they are their own, or creating a living sense of cultures. They might listen to stories, imagine the lives of objects, develop a sense of wonder through pedagogical experiments, pay deep attention in silence, and thus come to make meaningful the ideas from multiple traditions. Deep attention through different pedagogical encounters can loosen and undo the kinds of generalising and generic claims about identities and cultures that stem from superficial encounters. This means that intercultural education must allow time for reflection, dialogue, contemplation and expression through different rhythms and qualities of encounters. It also means that it is not simply a matter of one's own response in museum space; we also learn about the world from others, and not everything can be revealed through observation.

This will also involve creating spaces for culturally responsive and sustaining pedagogies which again work with the different forms and expressions of cultures in the lives of children and young people and their families and communities, which allows them to express and explain how cultures are manifested in living traditions and in people's lives. Jacqueline D'warte's research in this area offers a set of pedagogical resources that can supplement museum encounters, helping teachers to pay attention to the 'everyday' and support children to become researchers of their lives, and those of their families and communities. This undoes tendencies toward monoculture and monolingualism in schools.²⁸

The vision of intercultural education that we are developing in the museum supports the transportation of ideas and imagination back to school life. What matters, particularly in our times, is to challenge those tendencies to and desires for assimilation, absolutism, certainty, domination, and expropriation that are compelled by a desire for sameness and an image of closed identity. But educators must approach these matters delicately *and* educationally, creating opportunities to encounter the rich diversity of the world, whilst refusing the logics of monoculture and fixed identity.

²⁸ Ref: Jacqueline D'warte's bibliography, Western Sydney University <u>https://www.westernsydney.</u> edu.au/staff_profiles/WSU/doctor_jacqueline_d_warte

Overlap between development education and intercultural education: Development Education (DE) in Ireland: An overview, key resources and examples early years, primary and post-primary educational sectors.

Dr Patricia Kieran, Department of Learning, Society, and Religious Education, Mary Immaculate College, Limerick

Sedano suggests that Intercultural Education (ICE) facilitates greater understanding, interaction and communication among people of different cultures.²⁹ However, in Ireland intercultural education is more than a celebration and acknowledgement of cultural diversity. As an education response intercultural education challenges racism and discrimination and can:

"Empower young people to think critically, independently and systematically... prepare learners to participate effectively in society, both locally and globally, and make positive contributions towards a more just and equal world a priority".³⁰

Intercultural education has emerged as a clear policy in the Department of Education and Skills (DES) with a number of key guidelines and policy statements designed for an increasingly diverse society and educational system. After the non-statutory intercultural education guidelines were launched in 2010, a copy was made available to every teacher in the Republic of Ireland but without teacher in-service training, research suggests³¹ their effectiveness was limited and at times even counterproductive.³² Official policy is one thing, implementing it effectively is entirely another. Research has shown that teachers do not necessarily know how to apply intercultural education to their subject areas at a time when students have an urgent need for it.

The guidelines were generally well received as being extremely valuable and innovative. However, without any support for teachers in learning how to apply them, many teachers found them challenging and confusing. While the guidelines advocate an integrated wholeschool approach at primary and post-primary level, a difficulty lies in the fact that they are non-statutory. They are out-of-date and need to be updated to address the multiple educational and cultural changes that have taken place in the intervening decade and a half. There is a great need for high-quality intercultural education in Irish education. Unfortunately, as a consequence of budget cuts, the National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI) was closed in 2008. Furthermore, the Intercultural Education Guidelines pre-date *Síolta* the quality framework and *Aistear* (2009), National Early Years curriculum framework for children aged 0-6 years. *Síolta's* principles state that "quality early-childhood settings acknowledge and respect diversity and ensure that all children and families have their individual, personal, cultural and linguistic identity validated.

²⁹ Sedano, A.M. (2002). 'Teacher Training and Intercultural Education', in A.C. Del Canto, et al. (eds.), Intercultural Education: A Present-Day Challenge for Europe, Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid.

³⁰ Fiedler, M. and Pérez Piñán, A., eds. (2008). Teaching Globalisation and Diversity in the Knowledge Society An E-Book of Development Education and Intercultural Education Research for Teacher Educators, Limerick: Irish Aid.

³¹ Parker-Jenkins, M. and Corcoran, S. (2018). "hijab", "niqab" or neither? Messages on choice of dress for Muslim women in educational Institutions. *New Community Journal*, vol. 16(4), 64, pp.5-9.

³² Kavanagh, A.M. (2013). *Emerging models of intercultural education in Irish primary schools: a critical case study analysis.* PhD Thesis, Dublin City University.

In 2010 the DES developed an Intercultural Education (ICE) strategy in order to ensure:³³

- 1. All students experience an education that "respects the diversity of values, beliefs, languages and traditions in Irish society and is conducted in a spirit of partnership" (Education Act, 1998).
- 2. All education providers are assisted with ensuring that inclusion and integration (within an intercultural learning environment) become the norm.

At tertiary level intercultural education is characterised by a diversity of approaches. Some institutions have specific modules and a Masters in intercultural education, while others have a more integrated approach exploring this subject in the context of Development Education and also the intercultural dimension of a range of disciplines. There are multiple organisations that support ICE in Initial Teacher Education (ITE) programmes. DICE is an organisation that supports ITE students as they integrate intercultural perspectives and themes on their placements in classrooms. It provides a range of resources, ideas. At post-primary level, Ubuntu is a development education organisation that supports ICE through its focus on human rights. Another organisation, Experiment in International Living (EIL), provides language, cultural and educational training and activities for Irish students. There is no specific organisation focusing on ICE at early childhood education level. Other resources, such as the Anna Lindh Foundation, of which Mary Immaculate College, Maynooth University and Chester Beatty are members, have developed an excellent intercultural citizenship handbook.³⁴

Development Education (DE) in Ireland: An overview

Dr Patricia Kieran, Mary Immaculate College, Limerick

During the early development of *Embracing Cultural Diversity in the Classroom* project, a number of the partners identified an overlap in some key areas with Development Education (DE) and intercultural dialogue. This is a brief introduction to DE in the Republic of Ireland. DE is provided by Irish Aid, which sees it as:

"An educational process aimed at increasing awareness and understanding of the rapidly changing, interdependent and unequal world in which we live. It seeks to engage people in analysis, reflection and action for local and global citizenship and participation. It is about supporting people in understanding, and in acting to transform the social, cultural, political and economic structures which affect their lives and others at personal, community, national and international level". ³⁵

In the Republic of Ireland Initial Teacher Education (ITE) at primary level DICE (Development and Intercultural Education) is a national education initiative, funded through Irish Aid, to promote and support the integration of Development Education and Intercultural Education in Initial Teacher Education at primary level in Ireland (Mary Immaculate College, Marino Institute of Education, Dublin City University, National

³³ Op. Cit. No.14, Executive Summary.

³⁴ Anna Lindh Foundation (2014). The Anna Lindh Education Handbook, Intercultural Citizenship in the Euro-Mediterranean Region. Alexandria: Anna Lindh Foundation.

³⁵ Murphy, K. and IDEA Staff (2017). *Development Education in Ireland Report*, Dublin: Irish Development Education Association, Ireland, p.7.

University of Ireland Maynooth). The aim is to embed DE in a cross-curricular and integrated approach across the ITE programmes, with a view to students teaching DE topics on placement. DICE also works to influence policy and practice relating to Development Education and Intercultural Education in Ireland through engagement with key stakeholders and production of relevant research, guidelines and resources. At post-primary level, there are a number of key stakeholders including World Wise Global Schools, Concern Debates, Debt and Development Coalition, Global Action Plan, Young Social Innovators, BT Young Scientist and Technology Exhibition, and Teachers in Development and Learning.

DE seeks to move beyond the surface level to explore the causes and consequences and relationships involved in issues of justice/injustice, equality, human rights and development at a global/local level. In Ireland, DE is diverse and encompasses state organisations, international development organisations, Irish civil society organisations, individual practitioners and educational institutions. This diversity is cited as a key strength. DE concerns values, knowledge, skills and action and involves education (formal, non-formal and informal) about global justice issues in an interdependent world.³⁶ There are many convergences (value base, key themes – e.g. social justice, equality, human rights, racism) and divergences (aid and trade, global poverty) between DE and intercultural education.³⁷

In Ireland, DE is practiced by a range of actors including Development Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), community and voluntary organisations, educational institutions and networks, trade unions, educators, researchers and activists. It takes place in formal, non-formal and informal settings, engaging hundreds of thousands of people across all ages and communities throughout the island of Ireland each year.

DE in Ireland is not delivered in any uniform manner within or across all sectors (early childhood education, primary, post-primary and third level). While there are strategic initiatives (Green Schools, Trócaire, Irish Aid's *Our World Awards*), DE is often embedded in schools and programmes in a cross-curricular and integrated fashion by individual educators. There are multiple high-quality DE networks, professional groups (DICE, Ubuntu, IDEA, etc.) resources (e.g. journeys, lesson plans, ideas, ICT initiatives, reports), guidelines and funded initiatives (e.g., for ITE students and CPD for educators). Much material is freely and easily accessible and there are wonderful programmes that can support imaginative, interactive and high-quality learning. Educators who wish to explore DE in schools with children/students in an interactive and effective manner (less so for early childhood sectors, but more so for primary, post-primary and third-level educational contexts) have lots of support once they go looking for it. Yet the lack of a prescriptive or uniform approach or desire for conformity that is a strength of DE in Ireland, is also a weakness. In a crowded timetable, DE may well become invisible or relegated to a 'to do wish list' by some.

³⁶ Ibid. p.8.

³⁷ Fitzgerald, H. (2007). *The Relationship between Development Education and Intercultural Education in Initial Teacher Education*, Limerick: Irish Aid, p.17.

The Development Education in Ireland Report states:

"The Department of Education and Skills plays a crucial role in supporting and implementing the National Strategy on Educational for Sustainable Development (ESD) in Ireland. Its continued support for the Irish Aid Development Education Strategy is very important if there is to be a meaningful process for integration of Development Education into the education system, and for proper implementation".³⁸

The National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) advises the Minister of Education on the primary and post-primary curriculum, leads curriculum development and supports the implementation of changes in the curriculum. Therefore, the NCCA is a key stakeholder in the integration of DE into the curriculum.

Analysis of the current offer in museums in Ireland and Northern Ireland Jenny Siung, Head of Education, Chester Beatty

Museums in the Republic of Ireland

Museums play an important role in defining the identity of a nation. At any time in a nation's history, someone decides what is – and what is not – part of our 'national culture.' National museums are perceived as authoritative spaces with the potential to select what objects to collect and display. Moreover, by using these objects to tell stories, they can influence the ideas and values that contribute to our sense of national culture and identity.³⁹

Given the global nature of the Chester Beatty Collections, the museum has forged the way in intercultural dialogue in Ireland and has a track record of addressing this through several initiatives. In 2016, a year of commemoration marking the centenary of the Proclamation of the Irish Republic, the museum organised an international symposium, *The Role of National Museums in (Re)Negotiating National Identity*, to explore themes around how Collections and public programmes reflect contemporary cultural diversity and identity. As a follow-on from this theme, members of the public were interviewed for a vox pop on what it means to be Irish in 2016. Other key events includes a series of collaborations, seminars and projects addressing how the museum plays a significant role in fostering intercultural dialogue and learning.

- The Learning and Education Department project-led a collaboration with Dublin Interfaith Forum, Mary Immaculate College and Triskel Arts Centre, focused on *Intercultural competencies for social cohesion and integration in Ireland 2015– 2016*, funded by the Anna Lindh Foundation (ALF).
- In 2015, Irish Museums Association Education and Outreach forum invited the Chester Beatty to facilitate a training session in cultural diversity for museum professionals.
- In 2014, the museum held its first seminar on *Museums as Places for Intercultural Dialogue and Learning* and explored how Irish and international museum practice

³⁸ Op. Cit. No.33, p.13.

³⁹ Croke, F. (2018). Exploring Cultural Diversity and Identity at the Chester Beatty Library, *Art Libraries Journal*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp.137-142.

recognises the need to work with external partners and groups, as well as acknowledge the changing face of national identities in the twenty-first century.

- The ALF Irish Network delivered a one-day seminar in Mary Immaculate College, titled *Understanding Islam in Irish Education* (2013). This was project-led by the Chester Beatty in partnership with Kerry Action Development in Education, and Youth Work Ireland, Cork. Subjects in the national teaching curriculum aimed at Bachelor of Education students, as well as themes relevant to ALF members, were explored.
- The Council for National Cultural Institutions' Learning and Engagement subgroup organised a seminar in 2010, titled *Whose Culture is it? An exploration of cultural policy and practice in Irish cultural institutions today.* The seminar presented case studies of intercultural education programmes in museums and arts policy, as well as research findings. This seminar was hosted by the Chester Beatty.

The role of Irish museums in the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland

Museums can offer a space for multiple identities that exist in Ireland today, as well as helping people understand and engage with their own and others' histories and identities by creating opportunities for mutual understanding. Peers in some of the Irish national cultural institutions appear hesitant and unsure about how to approach multiethnic groups. However, a number of cultural and heritage organisations on the island of Ireland – including the Irish Museums Association, Heritage Council of Ireland and Museums Association of Northern Ireland – have recognised this need and now offer training programmes and guidelines that reflect this new cultural diversity. A Council of National Cultural Institutions (CNCI) was formed in 1998 by the then Department for the Arts, Heritage, and the Gaeltacht. The Learning and Engagement Group (LEG) is a subcommittee of the CNCI and has collaborated on a number of initiatives, including the publication of an education policy (2004) and an additional update in 2014 (*A Fresh View for the 21st Century: Education Community Outreach Policy Framework 2014*).⁴⁰

The group responded to the changing context with initiatives such as the *Arts in Education Charter*, launched by the Departments of Arts, Heritage, and the Gaeltacht, and the Department of Education and Skills, which strives to create collaboration between the areas of arts, culture and education. The collaboration between these two government departments was the first in the history of the Irish State and endeavoured to promote and encourage access to the arts for every child in the country. Creativity is at the centre of the development of a child. Therefore access to the arts in the education system is important. The provision of professional development for teachers in the arts –including early years, primary, and post-primary education – are just a number of examples. Yet there is no mention of cultural diversity in any of the sectors.

⁴⁰ Developed by the Education, Community, Outreach Working Group of the Council of National Cultural Institutions (CNCI) in association with Anne Gallagher. Drawing on the *Policy Framework for Education, Community, Outreach* (2003). Compiled by the Education, Community, Outreach Working Group of the Council of National Cultural Institutions, in association with Martin Drury and Susan Coughlan, Arts Consultants.

Analysis of case studies

Overview

Selected case studies were used in this section to illustrate some of the projects that have been carried out in the area of intercultural education in the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland and the UK. These were submitted by project partners from Mary Immaculate College, Maynooth College, the Intercultural Education Service, Heritec and Chester Beatty, as well as being submitted from invited colleagues from Mother Tongues Ireland, Youth Work Ireland and Shakespeare's Birthplace Trust (UK). Projects operating at a European level have been cited in the previous section.

These examples provided project partners insight into the current state of intercultural dialogue both in the education and cultural sectors. As these are examples, the project acknowledges this list is non-exhaustive. Four key themes or categories were identified in the analysis of the examples submitted by partners.

The examples provided by the partners fall into the following categories:

- **Type 1:** Language projects: projects involving learning language, sharing language, multilingualism or translanguaging.
- **Type 2:** Cross-cultural projects: projects that cross cultures, boundaries, societies and time.
- **Type 3:** Inter-faith projects: projects that engage students in discovering similarities and celebrating differences across religions.
- **Type 4:** Global citizenship projects: projects that make connections across the world to encourage an understanding, tolerance and cooperation.

Selected Case studies: summary

Туре 1	Primary or post-primary level
Language projects	
Mother Tongues, Republic of Ireland	Primary level
ESOL Programme, British Museum, UK	Post-primary level and adults
Culture Shake, Shakespeare's Birthplace Trust, UK	Post-primary level
The Language Toolkit, University of Glasgow, UK	Families
Туре 2	Primary or post-primary level
Cross-cultural projects	
From home to here, Mellon Centre for Migration Centres, Northern Ireland	Primary and post-primary level
Cultures in contact, British Museum, UK	Post-primary level
Youth Work Ireland, Republic of Ireland	Families
Storytelling from Shahnama, Chester Beatty	Primary level
Туре З	Primary or post-primary level
Inter-faith projects	
Inter-religious dialogue café, Republic of Ireland	Primary level
Туре 4	Primary or post-primary level
Global citizenship	
Learning to see through another's eyes, Republic of Ireland	Teachers
DNA project, Manchester Museum, UK	Primary level
UCL project, Grant Museum, UK	Post-primary level

Type 1: Language projects

Mother Tongues (Republic of Ireland)

Mother Tongues Ireland is a non-profit organisation that promotes multilingualism for schools, families and arts organisations. *The Language Explorers* project and learning resource aims to introduce language awareness activities in the daily practice of teachers to encourage the whole school community to be proactive about using pupils' linguistic diversity as a teaching resource. Children learned something new about one another and gained an interest in learning new languages and discovering more about other cultures, writing systems, etc. Challenges include teachers' lack of language knowledge and sometimes teachers' negative attitude towards the importance of language learning and the lack of awareness of the relevance of children's home languages in the curriculum.

Website: https://mothertongues.ie/

Culture Shake, Shakespeare's Birthplace Trust, (UK)

Culture Shake is an EU-funded project with partners from schools, universities and the Shakespeare Birthplace Trust. It aims to combine the latest findings in multilingual didactics with intercultural communication, in order to integrate students from different cultural and linguistic backgrounds, including refugee children. Culture Shake worked with post-primary school students from the partner schools involved on Shakespeare's *A Midsummer Night's Dream* and *The Tempest*, creating peer teaching activities that incorporate the students' heritage languages into the learning.

Website: <u>https://www.shakespeare.org.uk/explore-shakespeare/blogs/eu-funded-</u>culture-shake-has-started/

English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) Programme (UK)

The British Museum ESOL programme started as a pilot in 2003 following the introduction of the ESOL Core Curriculum. The new curriculum provided for embedded language learning, where the grammar was taught through themes and topics. This gave ESOL tutors the chance to create their own schemes of work according to the interests of their learners. In turn, this allowed museums with the opportunity to develop programmes where engagement with museum objects supported language learning and facilitated learner-led discourse around museum Collections. By interacting with museum Collections, learners have the opportunity to explore connections with objects, have conversations that might be difficult inside the classroom, unlock personal stories and become active agents in their learning.

Website: https://www.britishmuseum.org/learn/adult-learning/esol

The Language Toolkit (UK)

The Language Toolkit is a set of creative activities and ideas to be used in a variety of multilingual settings. A team of researchers from the University of Glasgow (Dr Lavinia Hirsu and Dr Sally Zacharias), together with a team of creative artists (Dobrochna Futro, Elizabeth Dulemba, Sara Pinto and Richy Carey), have gathered and tested activities which embrace and reflect a translingual approach to language learning and teaching. The kit is available to all teachers, practitioners and language users who want to experience and do new and exciting things with their communicative resources.

As language researchers and practitioners, the initiative believes in the creative potential of languages and the important role of all our communicative resources. In a world where languages oftentimes become measures of someone's identity, place and individual worth, we have a duty to support our learners of all linguistic backgrounds. The Language Toolkit aims to:

- Create inclusive environments where languages are respected, valued and made visible.
- Inspire our learners to cherish all their communicative resources (e.g. using effectively words, images, body language, artistic and/or digital forms to reach one other).
- Build positive attitudes towards languages in our classrooms and beyond.
- Break walls that separate languages and language users because we have much more to learn from each other's sounds, voices, words, images, moves, songs, etc.

Website: https://blogs.glowscotland.org.uk/gc/creativepracticestranslang/resources/

Type 2: Interfaith projects

Inter-religious dialogue café (Republic of Ireland)

The Inter-religious dialogue café event that took place in a Catholic primary school in a Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools (DEIS) school in Limerick. This interfaith dialogue café gave children an opportunity to engage at a deep level with members of four different faith traditions: Baha'i, Catholic, Muslim and Quaker. The project aimed to stimulate children's curiosity and openness to dialogue with members of diverse faiths. It provided children with an opportunity to explore concrete materials and sacred symbols from a range of traditions, as well as providing an opportunity to engage in face-to-face dialogue with members of a range of religious traditions. It aimed to bring together and connect members of diverse faiths in a relaxed, interactive, educational environment where participants were invited to explore a range of questions, learn from each other and appreciate people's complex, diverse and rich traditions drawing on story, imagination, lived experience and personal commitment.

Type 3: Cross-cultural projects

Small Worlds (Northern Ireland)

Small Worlds are café-style events hosted by members of Belfast Friendship Club. The workshops provide a safe space for participants to encounter people from different backgrounds and parts of the world. They are carefully managed by an experienced facilitator and hosted in various community locations or in schools. Asylum seekers and refugees from different countries are seated at different tables and bring along information about their home country, culture, climate, food, music, language. They also tell their own personal story.

Others attending the workshops are invited to spend c.15 minutes at each table talking to the asylum seekers or refugees and may ask any question. The session ends with a whole group discussion. A typical Small Worlds workshops last 1–2 hours, with 20 to 24 participants and for hosts. One such event was organised as part of an Arabic cultural awareness session run by Lisburn and Castlereagh City Council. Ongoing events take place throughout Northern Ireland and may be requested by any organisation, including schools.

Small Worlds project aims to:

- Help overcome fear and mistrust of those seen as 'different.'
- Address misunderstandings and myths.
- Foster respect, trust and empathy.
- Bring similarities between people to light.

The workshops are run across Northern Ireland. Any group or school may request a workshop. The group or school requesting the workshop provides the venue and any refreshments required. The Belfast Friendship Club does the rest. The most significant outcome of these workshops is an increase in empathy and understanding of why assylum seekers and refugees have come to Northern Ireland. Another significant outcome of the challenge of commonly held perceptions and prejudices about those who are seeking asylum or who have refugee status in our community.

Website: http://www.belfastfriendshipclub.org/small-worlds/

Cultures in Contact (UK)

Cultures in Contact was a three-year project (2009–2011) supported by Deutsche Bank. Its aim was to create a historical framework to help young people develop an awareness and understanding of their position in a world continually shaped by the interaction of different cultures. The project brought groups of young people together with a wide range of performers, writers and media professionals to stimulate critical and creative responses to experiences based around objects in the British Museum's Collection.

With a focus on London secondary schools, the project addressed the need for young people to develop an awareness of their position as global citizens as well as being able to recognise how they relate to a multicultural national identity. The project will take place over a three-year period, taking young people on a cultural journey through history, with activities adapting to young people's changing interests, modes of thinking and expression. Issues addressed included cultural understanding, diversity, citizenship, resistance and heritage, with activities linked the school curriculum.

Website: https://www.britishmuseum.org/

Youth Work Ireland (Republic of Ireland)

A youth outreach development project with the aim of community integration of young Syrian refugees and their families into their new lives using art as a medium to engage in intercultural dialogue, by discovering who the others are, and how similar or different they can be to one's self. The project aims to give young people a safe space to experience and reflect on self-identity and diversity using critical thinking activities to develop and produce an interactive storytelling puppet show with an understanding of intercultural dialogue and an increased knowledge of the single story. Members of the local Syrian community collaborated with families and community groups and facilitated by Youth Work Ireland Cork over a ten-week period resulting in a performance for Culture Night.

Website: http://www.ywicork.com/

Storytelling, music and art from the Heroes and Kings of the Shahnama (Persian Book of Kings) (Republic of Ireland)

The Chester Beatty celebrated 1,000 years of the Persian Book of Kings with an exhibition *Heroes and Kings of the Shahnama* (2010–2011). Local primary schools were invited to participate in a storytelling and art project through music and drama with storyteller Xanthe Gresham and musician Arash Moradi, to provide stories around the *Shahnama*. This was followed by a week of visual art workshops in the classroom with Iranian artist Roxana Manouchehri. The Chester Beatty worked with Educate Together schools to participate in the project. Schools attended a one-hour storytelling and music session in the museum followed by an off-site art workshop in the classroom.

Website: https://chesterbeatty.ie/

Type 4: Global citizenship projects

Learning to read the world through each other's eyes' (Republic of Ireland)

Learning to read the world through other eyes is an online study resource supporting participants to develop a deeper understanding of how language and systems of belief, values and representation affect how we interpret the world and identify how different groups understand issues of development. It is a four-part study programme and looks at the idea of culture and questions the centrality of Western and Eurocentric stories, looking at the epistemic violence done by ignoring the stories and knowledge of others, in particular indigenous communities.

It addresses the gap in global citizenship education and development education discourses by encouraging interrogation and examination of assumptions and looking at how ideas, values and curricula are interpreted and perceived in other contexts, in particular from marginalised perspectives. The project design is particularly sensitive to classroom narratives and approaches that depoliticise and de-contextualise marginalised experiences by centring their focus solely on Western ideas of enlightenment, knowledge and understanding (presumed to be superior), or focusing on the individual rather than history, institutions and different practices.

Website: <u>https://developmenteducation.ie/resource/learning-to-read-the-world-through-other-eyes/</u>

Egyptian DNA, Manchester Museum (UK)

Manchester Museum deliver a science workshop to schools which focuses on intercultural dialogue through intercultural education facilitated through the Egyptian Collection. In 2019, 500 pupils in 40 schools received sessions. The intact tomb group of Khnum-nakht and Nakht-ankh is a star attraction of Manchester Museum's Egyptology Collection. Coffin inscriptions identify the men as sons of the same woman, Khnum-aa, giving them their popular name: the 'Two Brothers'. Recently, through advancements of DNA techniques such as the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR), colleagues from the Manchester Museum and the University of Manchester were able to determine the kinship of the two brothers. It is through this fascinating story the Museum frames a PCR workshop with students at the Manchester Museum. Students extract DNA from their own cheek cells, amplify this through PCR and then visualise DNA fragments produced through gel electrophoresis. The workshops are led by PhD students with a background in genetics and PCR techniques, which provides students with direct and exclusive access to scientific techniques and an insight into university life with the aim of increasing aspirations to university and science-related subjects. Students get to talk about genealogy and their own heritage and culture through the workshop.

Website: <u>https://www.manchester.ac.uk/discover/news/ancient-dna-results-end-4000-</u> year-old-egyptian-mummy-mystery-in-manchester/ and <u>https://learningmanchester.</u> wordpress.com/pcr-workshop/

UCL Culture, Grant Museum, University College London (UK)

UCL Culture developed a project in partnership with Cardinal Pole Catholic School, Hackney, London, and the BCU School, Kalimantan, and the Borneo Nature Foundation (BNF) in Indonesia about bio-robotics, animal movement and conservation inspired by the Collection at the Grant Museum of Zoology at UCL. Four UCL departments: Computer Science, UCL Culture, Bio-Medical Engineering and Genetics, Evolution and Environment were involved. The schools were able to build links with each other and UCL. Young people learned about animal movement and bio-robotics through actual or virtual workshops in the Grant Museum in their schools and, where appropriate, in the field. They engaged with the concept of global citizenship and embraced cultural exchange, working together to develop a prototype robot or sensor technologies to help with gibbon and environmental conservation.

Website: <u>https://www.ucl.ac.uk/ucl-east/news/2019/may/hackney-school-makes-film-ucl-grant-museum</u>

Emerging themes

Overview

In the research and development of the project, thematic analysis was used to examine the case studies provided.⁴¹ The definitions were used as a starting point to develop the coding framework. The codes were analysed to explore emerging themes and the following themes emerged from the analysis of the case studies.

- Skills: focus on training and up-skilling for educators.
- Competences: creating a set of competences for educators.
- Attitudes: equip staff with emotional toolkit to engage in this work.
- Topics: select universal topics and themes.
- Teaching methods: use inclusive and sustainable pedagogies.

What might an intercultural school's programme in a museum look like?

Overview

This section brings together the findings from the case studies and the contributions from the partners which informed the development phase of the project. These findings started with a set of recommendations, based on common and recurring themes as a means to develop the foundations of an intercultural school's programme to support teachers and students access the Chester Beatty Collections.

Project deliverables

The following project outcomes were identified at the beginning of the project as desired outcomes:

- Self-directed trails.
- Tours.
- Pre- and post-visit support materials.
- Continuous Professional Development (CPD).
- Training for staff and volunteers.

Recommendations

There were a number of key recommendations from these case studies for museums to follow when designing and providing for students and their teachers. The following common themes emerged from the research and underpinned the ethos of the development phase in relation to the deliverables for schools.

⁴¹ Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology, *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, pp.77-110.

- 1. Provide a respectful environment for learning for students and teachers.
- 2. Develop 4–5 strong topics for study that reflect and respond to the Collections.
- 3. Use cross-curricular approaches in the development of content and resources.
- 4. Use object-based learning to develop the workshops and resources.
- 5. Use visual literacy methods/visual thinking strategies.
- 6. Use creativity in the workshop development.
- 7. Provide opportunities to facilitate discussion.
- 8. Use of pair work and teamwork.
- 9. Allow time for feedback.

Methodologies, methods and learning outcomes

Introduction

The intended outcomes of development of this project aims to equip teachers with tools to help children from diverse backgrounds connect with their community and contribute to their sense of identity, which is central to their development. To encourage and promote the voice of the children, to unlock their creativity, to enable them to share their thoughts stimulates peer-to-peer learning, which has the potential to benefit them in every environment, as well as across the curriculum. The methodologies and methods used in this section refer to the different approaches and the tools selected for delivering the project outcomes.

Methodologies

The methodologies or approaches outlined here describe the orientations which underpin the pedagogical methods adopted in this project. These are:

- Dialogic teaching and learning.
- Multisensory learning approach.

These two approaches essentially are the building blocks of the programme, defining everything from the trails and tours to the CPD.

Dialogic teaching and learning

Dialogic teaching is what happens between teachers and their pupils working together to build their own and each other's knowledge and ideas to develop coherent thinking.⁴²

- 1. Knowledge is not fixed it means different things to different people in different times and places.
- 2. The dialogue between these different perspectives leads to new understandings and new knowledge.
- 3. Teachers and students can become more fully engaged in learning in an environment where these differences are respected and rigorously explored.
- 4. Such exploration, where meanings are constructed from the inside by learners in dialogue, rather than imposed from the outside, leads to powerful learning.

⁴² Lyle, S. (2008). *Dialogic Teaching: Discussing Theoretical Contexts and Reviewing Evidence from Classroom Practice*, Swansea Institute of Education, Wales, p.230.

5. Learning through dialogue leads not only to content knowledge but improved thinking skills.

"Argumentation and dialogue are not simply alternative patterns of communication; they are principled approaches to pedagogy..." ⁴³

Multisensory learning approach

A multisensory learning approach is a term many schools use to describe teaching methods that involve engaging more than one sense at a time. Involving the use of visual, auditory and kinesthetic-tactile pathways, a multisensory approach can enhance memory and ability to learn. This can also include taste, smell, touch, sight, hearing and movement. The students are able to experience a lesson through multiple pathways that can best stimulate their brains and engage them more deeply in the subject matter.⁴⁴ There is a long history in the educational literature dating back to Montessori, John Dewey and Grace Fernald, just to name a few.⁴⁵

Methods

Object-Based Learning (OBL)

Object-Based Learning (OBL) is a student-centred learning approach that uses objects to facilitate deep learning. The use of objects can act as multi-sensory "thinking tools" to promote learning. The objects are used to stimulate the learners' imagination and to help them apply their understanding to other contexts and problems. The central proposition of OBL is that working with objects mediates and strengthens learning.⁴⁶

⁴³ Wolfe, S. and Alexander, J.R. (2010). *Argumentation and dialogic teaching: alternative pedagogies for a changing world*, Beyond Current Horizons Project, UK, p.15.

⁴⁴ Davies, C. (2012). Creating Multisensory Environments: Practical ideas for teaching and learning, Routledge.

⁴⁵ Definition from the Gateway School: <u>https://thegatewayschool.com/multisensory-approach-special-education/</u>

⁴⁶ Romanek, D. and Lynch, B. (2008). 'Touch and the Value of Object Handling: Final Conclusions for a New Sensory Museology', in H.J. Chatterjee (ed.), *Touch in Museums: Policy and Practice in Object Handling*, Oxford and New York: Berg.



Handling objects © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS)

Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) is a teaching method that improves critical thinking skills through teacher-facilitated discussions of visual images. VTS encourages participation through a group problem-solving process. It uses art to teach thinking, communication skills, and visual literacy. Students contribute to the discussion by presenting their own observations and ideas to the class. All contributions are accepted and considered neutrally by the teacher and class, so that students can learn from the perspectives of others.

VTS emphasises the student learning process, individually and in conjunction with others, rather than the instructor's dissemination of knowledge. Therefore, VTS is learner-driven, it places the power in students' control. It is process focused not product focused – students are not given a right answer because the process of learning and discussing is the answer. VTS fosters critical thinking skills.⁴⁷

⁴⁷ Yenawine, P. (2013). *Visual Thinking Strategies: Using Art to Deepen Learning Across School Disciplines,* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard Education Press.



Exploring the Collections © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Learning outcomes

Development of creative and critical thinking skills

Critical and creative thinking is essential for students to become successful learners.

This general capability has four main parts:

- 1. Posing questions, gathering, organising and processing information and ideas.
- 2. Imagining possibilities, suggesting alternatives, seeking solutions and putting ideas into action.
- 3. Talking about and giving reasons for their thinking and applying knowledge in new situations.
- 4. Applying logic and reasoning, drawing conclusions and designing a course of action and evaluating procedures and results.

During their primary and post-primary years, students develop critical and creative thinking as they imagine possibilities, consider alternatives, and create innovative solutions. They apply logic and reasoning to develop a course of action and weigh up the consequences.⁴⁸

⁴⁸ See: https://www.education.sa.gov.au/parenting-and-child-care/your-childs-education/ australian-curriculum-general-capabilities/critical-and-creative-thinking

Definitions:

Critical and creative thinking are defined by the Australian Curriculum online resource as:

Critical thinking is the process we use to reflect on, assess and judge the assumption underlying our own and others' ideas and efforts.

Creative thinking is the process we use to develop ideas that are unique, useful and worth of further elaboration.

Website <u>https://www.australiancurriculum.edu.au/f-10-curriculum/general-capabilities/</u> <u>critical-and-creative-thinking/</u>

Building an intercultural school's programme: Part 4

Programme development

Introduction

This section summarises the different areas of the project development and different approaches taken. The aim of the programme is to: provide teachers with easy access to the Collections; breaking down the challenges of unfamiliar cultures; and empowering them to use free learning resources to promote Visual Thinking and Object-Based Learning with children in primary and post-primary schools.



Preparing content for new guided tours © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Tours

Tours using VTS and OBL were created around five themes:

- How things are made.
- Fashion.
- Journeys.
- Fantasy and imagination myth.
- Sacred.

The themes were selected through a process of consultation at partner meetings and in conjunction with the Chester Beatty's team of volunteers. For the initial development phases, a framework template was created to develop two pilot themed tours: *Journeys* and *How things are made*.⁴⁹ This framework was applied to a further series of tours and piloted with five groups at primary level and one at post-primary. The pilot tours were delivered by Chester Beatty volunteers, many of whom already have an extensive knowledge of the Collection.

⁴⁹ See Appendix 1: Chester Beatty Guided Tours Framework



Designing content for gallery trails © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Training for volunteers

To support volunteers in the delivery of the tours, training was provided in Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) and Object-Based Learning (OBL) in 2019. Plans to continue training in VTS in 2020 – in collaboration with The LAB Gallery, Dublin City Council Arts Office – were postponed due to Covid-19.



Training session for volunteer guides and facilitators © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin

Self-directed trails

Five trails were developed around the same themes as the tours. The purpose of the trails is to draw pupils into the objects and develop higher-level thinking. Unlike traditional museum trails, which encourage a lot of writing or drawing, the main objective of the new trails is to encourage pupils to look at and discuss the objects, and to make connections to their own knowledge and experience. The trails are supported by a guidance sheet for helpers.⁵⁰

As part of the research and development phase of this project, the Chester Beatty organised a number of pilot Continuous Professional Development (CPD) sessions for trainee teachers and teachers in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. The sessions incorporated Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) and Object-Based Learning (OBL), and linked in with local arts and cultural organisations as a means to highlight potential learning opportunities for other teachers in their area. These took place in Mary Immaculate College Limerick (Republic of Ireland), the Discovery Centre, Lough Neagh, Armagh (Northern Ireland) and Chester Beatty (Republic of Ireland). There were approximately 100 participants at these events and feedback was collated as part of the evaluation process. The feedback highlighted the lack of know-how amongst most teachers when it comes to working with museum Collections, and of how Collections can support their teaching practice. However, once the trainee teachers and teachers were provided creative and critical thinking tools, they discovered they can access knowledge from cultural organisations for their teaching practice.

Continuous Professional Development (CPD)

During the course of the research and development phase of the project, three CPD events were held to introduce teachers and other education specialists to the project. These sessions included Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS) and Object-Based Learning (OBL), and addressed how to use these methodologies both in the classroom and museum. These took place in Mary Immaculate College Limerick; Discovery Centre, Lough Neagh, Armagh; and the Chester Beatty.

CPD Mary Immaculate College, Limerick (February 2019)

The project partner from Mary Immaculate College invited Jenny Siung, Head of Education at the Chester Beatty, to provide a training session for initial teacher training students on 14 February 2019 in VTS using a multi-faith resource the Chester Beatty developed with another project partner, the Intercultural Education Services of Northern Ireland in 2014–2015.

40 trainee teachers were introduced to world faiths through the Collection of the Chester Beatty using VTS. This was complimented by an object handling session, facilitated by Justyna Chmielewska, Education Officer at the Chester Beatty. A case study was drawn up with feedback from the students.

⁵⁰ See Appendices 2 and 3.

CPD Discovery Centre, Armagh (October 2019)

The second CPD took place in the Discovery Centre of Lough Neagh, County Armagh, Northern Ireland, on the 10 October 2019. This was organised by the Intercultural Education Services of the Education Authority. It was agreed that local input from Northern Ireland would be important in the programme, hence the Ulster Museum Education Department was invited to talk to teachers about how to work with museum objects. A local Northern Irish/Sri Lankan artist provided a hands-on activity for attendees as a potential tool to use in the classroom.

80 teachers attended the session and were introduced to:

- The intercultural schools project.
- Object-Based Learning (OBL).
- Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS).
- Hands-on art-making activity aimed at teachers with an artist using traditional Sri Lankan craft.
- How to use OBL and VTS with the Ulster Museum Collections.
- Evaluation.

CPD Dublin (November 2019)

The third CPD took place in the Chester Beatty on the 16 November 2019. This was organised by the Chester Beatty. 35 teachers attended the session and were introduced to:

- The intercultural schools project.
- Object-Based Learning.
- Visual Thinking Strategies with Dublin City Council Arts Office, looking at their EU-funded project *Permission to Wonder*.
- Workshop for teachers using new gallery trails and tours (on the theme of *Journeys*) or were given the opportunity to test the prototype of the *How things are made* trail.
- How to use museum objects when exploring multilingualism with Mother Tongues Ireland.
- The importance of collaboration between the formal education sector and museums.
- Cross-border collaboration with museums and teachers: Intercultural Education Services, (Education Authority) Northern Ireland.
- *Moments of stuckness*: What are the concrete moments of 'stuckness and perplexity' that we still navigate in the classroom? How might we imagine together different pedagogical and pastoral responses? What are the limits of education, *The Enquiring Classroom* project?
- Evaluation.

Evaluation

Throughout each phase of the project, evaluation was collected from project participants. Once again, the feedback, although similar throughout, highlighted the lack of know-how amongst most teachers when it comes to working with museum collections and how collections can enhance and support their teaching practice. However, once the trainee teachers and teachers were provided creative and critical thinking tools, they discovered they can access knowledge for teaching from cultural organisations.

CPD Mary Immaculate College, Limerick, February 2019

Table 1

Feedback from pilot training session, Mary Immaculate College, February 2019, facilitated by the Chester Beatty with initial trainee teachers using VTS and OBL.

One thing I liked	One thing I did not like	One thing I will take away
 Use of different artefacts to portray world beliefs. I liked the hands-on approach to the objects and being introduced to the idea of utilising a museum and the objects in my teaching. The Visual Thinking Strategy: 'See, Think, Wonder'. Groupwork and the content was very interesting & writing on the table. Hands on. I liked working with the objects and the theme. Freedom for children to explore images and artefacts. Deeper meaning of pictures and objects and discovering for themselves. 'See, Think, Wonder' on various images – so fun for kids too and real objects. Discovering the symbols. Deeper meaning of the pictures and objects and discovering for themselves. 	 Study of painting/photos as opposed to physical artefacts. Too much feedback maybe; a bit overwhelming. How long it took I felt it could have been covered quicker. The 2nd part felt like a lot of repetition. Needs more hands on/active work, e.g. writing, drawing, sharing ideas. I didn't like that we didn't have enough. time for the exercise with the objects. Clearer instructions needed in task two. Talking about the images. Didn't like confusing questions. 	 The importance of artefacts when emphasising different religions. Would use the different pieces of world religious artefacts to support teaching. The Visual Thinking Strategy. The resources (online). More focus on observation of religions and discover vs sitting down and reading religious education. More observation and self- learning. Will use the above strategy in class and more confident Linking museum & class together. Research before teaching. Visual Thinking Strategies. More observation and self- learning.

CPD Discovery Centre, Lough Neagh, County Armagh, October 2019

- Participants were posed four key questions and the response was very positive, as illustrated in the table below.

Table 2

Feedback from the pilot training session, County Armagh, October 2019, organised by the Intercultural Education Service (Northern Ireland) and Chester Beatty for teachers using VTS and OBL. Facilitated by Heritec, Ulster Museum and Iocal Sri-Lankan/ Northern Irish artist.

- Participants were asked four key questions in the evaluation of the CPD.
- On a scale of 1–5, how well do you feel that the objectives for the day were met?
- 1. I have a clearer idea of how schools might collaborate with museums and others to explore history, culture, language and identity with children and young people.
- 2. I have explored Visual Thinking Strategies and Object-Based Learning as creative tools for the classroom and museum.
- 3. I have learned about support and resources available.
- 4. I have explored potential opportunities to collaborate with colleagues from other schools.

	1 Not Well	2	3	4	5 Very Well
Objective 1	0%	0%	0%	12%	88%
Objective 2	0%	3%	0%	15%	82%
Objective 3	0%	0%	3%	12%	85%
Objective 4	0%	9%	21%	21%	43%

CPD Chester Beatty, November 2019

Feedback from pilot training session, Chester Beatty, November 2019. Table 3 Mentimeter slide



Pilot gallery tours: children's voice

After the CPD workshops, the Chester Beatty provided a series of pilot tours for primary and post-primary schools. Students showed how much knowledge they had based on their personal experiences in the world. It is important for the museum to provide the space and time for young people to explore together as a class and discover and share their knowledge of the objects. This provision of time and a safe space, as well as the encouragement of the guide to listen, transforms the learning experience of the individual student and the whole class. In each of the pilot primary and postprimary school tours, numerous stories and experiences inspired by the Chester Beatty Collections were told.

The feedback was not always object-specific, yet they triggered a story about a journey or reminded the students that they too collected similar things at home including books, coins, shells and other found objects. Some of the students were able to read Arabic in the Islamic Collection in front of their peers, while for others it was their first time to speak in front of their class and teacher about a culture reflected in an object, even though English is not their first language. Feedback from the post-primary school teacher highlighted that the facilitated visit encouraged those students viewed as "not academic" to flourish and to express their knowledge and experiences inspired by the tour.

Online learning resources

As with most museums, access to content is both physical and virtual. Many schools in the Republic of Ireland and in Northern Ireland are unable to make regular visits to arts and cultural venues. As part of Chester Beatty's Strategic Plan 2016–2020, a new website was launched at the end of 2018. Content aimed at teachers is now available on the Chester Beatty website, including learning resources on world faiths, literacy and art history as well as science, technology, engineering, art and maths (STEAM). Images from the Islamic, East Asian and European Collections are available on a digital platform. An aspiration of the programme is to encourage teachers to use Visual Thinking Strategies and Object-Based Learning when exploring the online images in their classroom.

Outcomes

Key outcomes of this project will include the foundation for intercultural museum programmes for schools in the Republic of Ireland and in Northern Ireland. The personal development of the child and the opportunity to capture their voice are essential elements in the engagement with this age group. The aim is to increase intercultural awareness in the Chester Beatty and among teachers, pupils and the education sector. More importantly, the target audience and museum will develop an improved know-how in interacting with people of other cultural groups. As a result of this project, the Chester Beatty Learning and Education Department has initiated the first of a series of Continuous Professional Development programmes with the Junior Cycle Religious Education team, which steers the development of the teaching of religious education in post-primary schools. Partners in the Intercultural Education Service have extended Continuous Professional Development for hard-to-reach schools in Northern Ireland and offer Object-Based Learning, Visual Thinking Strategies and language support for teachers and pupils using museum objects.

Conclusion

Why are these tools and methodologies important when working with students in museums? Young people are encouraged to share their personal experiences and knowledge with the help of the guide, rather than being provided with continuous information throughout the tour. Children and young people should not be underestimated when it comes to their knowledge of themselves and the world around them. The tools and methodologies implemented lead to an enriched learning experience for both museum and class. The aim of the intercultural school's programme is for children not only to learn about the objects in the Chester Beatty, but also learn about themselves and their peers within the cultural context of the tours. Teachers are encouraged to prepare for their visits with pre and post activities available online, as a way to continue this enriched learning experience.

Our children face a number of challenges in an ever-changing world. Life for children appears to be more complex than ever, especially with uncertainty of identity among their peers, what it means to be Irish in a culturally diverse society and how to express oneself in the midst of competing digital platforms. The role of the Chester Beatty to support newcomer children and their peers in cultural expression is vital. Museums can provide safe spaces for these cultural interactions to occur and create a much-needed dialogue in the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland today.

Appendix 1

Chester Beatty Guided Tours Framework, developed by project partners

Aims:

Populate each of the columns with exercises and indicate potential links with the Collection.

- 1. Task: Aim today to complete travel and movement strand.
- 2. Narrative: Gather key ideas to enable a story that frames the Collections educationally and in terms of intercultural education. Think about the museum as a space of movement, of journeys, of relationships, and of exchange. What might be an anchoring narrative? What fits well with intercultural education? Develop this early September.
- 3. Collaboration: Locate potential dates for schools to engage.

Title	Rationale
Journeys	 The aim of intercultural education is to shift from a focus on identity to reciprocal exchange and encounter. It focuses on relationships and challenges ideas of fixed and essential identity. The Chester Beatty Collection is a Collection that reveals how ideas, material, rituals, beliefs, and objects move. To be alive is to move, to exchange and to change. Some of the exercises and journeys involve interiority and change. Some involve turning to the cosmos. Thinking about what moves and what stops moving: printing from Japan to the Gutenberg Bible. From the wheel to the stirrup. What ideas today might not be getting traction? What difference does it make now that we can print everything? How do ideas move?
Beauty and Power	 Is fashion just a question of individual style? What is the symbolic power of clothing? Exploring clothing also allows us to think about the function, purpose and expression of clothing, and to think more deeply about conventions associated with different kinds of clothing. It can open into conversations about bodies, images and fashion in the contemporary context, as well as to discussions of the sacred and the secular. This exploration extends from fashion to bodies, gestures, and symbolic and ritual movements, explored in the section on the sacred and profane. Reflect also on other ideas of power and how they operate today. Is it similar or different?

The Lives of Things	- Museums are spaces of Collection, of memory and encounter. They provide an opportunity to explore different identities and cultures through material objects and their stories. This enables ways of encountering the worlds of others that can cultivate curiosity while providing the safety of distance or time. But they are also interesting spaces that allow us to learn about and imagine the stories of objects, their journeys and the lives that they were a part of. The site of the museum provides a helpful opportunity to think about the 'nature of things', as objects that may have been functional or part of ritual are now on display. They also raise issues of ownership, provenance, and cultural and religious identity. What gives something value and what makes it valuable? It allows us to talk about museums as public institutions and what it means for a thing to be public.
Fantasy and the Imagination	 Fantasy and myth Hybrids, imaginary creatures. Magic spells books. Dark magic. Causing harm. Talismans Are humans different today than they were in the past? How we respond to change? How we respond to it? Advanced/primitive. African/indigenous traditions. Egyptian. Aesthetics and the relation to the thing: putting on display? Art: contemporary art: curated. Is it different questions? What is the connection with the everyday?
The Sacred and the Profane	 The Chester Beatty is not a space of faith formation, but it respects and welcomes those of all faiths. It is a space for inter-faith and intra-faith encounter with the beliefs, objects and rituals that are central to religious traditions. Part of this involves exploring commonality – for example, understanding the religions of the Book – and provide connections through the contrasts of key faiths. These exercises trace the lineages of rituals, beliefs, ideas and objects, paying attention to symbols, to colours, and to images. It explores the relationships, experiences and identities that things make possible? What would a nation without a flag be? What objects enable ritual or contemplation that is essential for the embodiment of a tradition? Think also about rituals of cleanliness and beauty and how they relate to religion.
Silence, Gaps, the Invisible	 What is missing and who is missing from these Collections? What difference would it make for them to be included? Opportunity to reflect more broadly on this space and on questions of representation. Perhaps it is a space that is inclusive? What might we pass by? Imagine a museum of the future.

Appendix 2

Gallery trail: Introduction for teachers

This trail directs students to different objects in galleries of the Chester Beatty. The trail can be used as a standalone exercise during your visit or you may wish to develop work around particular objects, as suggested in the before and after sections of this resource.

- Each object in the trail connects to an overarching theme.
- Each object has a set of activity questions attached to it that can be used by students while they are working in the galleries.
- Each object sheet is designed to support the students in looking at, thinking about, and discussing objects on display in the gallery. The different icons show the types of activity.
- The trail can be used with single students, in pairs or as a small group. Objects can be explored in any order.
- Most of the activities are verbal. However, where space is provided for recording, the student may undertake this or an adult helper as is most appropriate for the students involved.
- Familiarise the students and accompanying adults with the chosen activity sheets at school, before the day of the visit. Make sure students and adults know what they are to do and are familiar with the vocabulary used on the sheets or that they may encounter in the gallery.

Appendix 3



Museum Explorer Gallery Trails for Schools Fantasy & Imagination



РарХХа

Selected bibliography

Corcoran, S. (2019). Exploring a new paradigm for Intercultural Competence Development and Leadership.

Chester Beatty Library (2015). *Ways of Seeing II* (Interfaith Learning resource), Dublin: Chester Beatty Library.

Department of Education and Skills, *Education for Sustainability: The National Strategy on Education for Sustainable Development 2014–2020*, 2014, Dublin: Department of Education and Skills.

Golden, B. and Roche, A. (2018). *Journeys: A Teacher's Handbook for Exploring Migration and Migrant Rights in the Primary Classroom*, Limerick: Curriculum Development Unit.

Intercultural Education Services (2012). *Ways of Seeing I* (language support learning resource), Dublin: Chester Beatty Library.

Irish Aid and Development Education (2006). *Describing... Understanding... Challenging...* the Story of Human Development in Today's World, Limerick: Irish Aid.

Irish Development Education Association (2013). *Good Practice Guidelines for Development Education in Schools*, Dublin: Irish Development Education Association.

Irish National Teachers' Organisation (2004). *Intercultural Education in the Primary School*, Dublin: INTO.

Jeffers, G. (2015). Transition Year in Action, Dublin: The Liffey Press.

Huber, J. (2012). Intercultural competence for all, preparation for living in a *heterogeneous world*, Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing.

Murray, C. and O'Doherty, A., eds. (2001). *'Eist': Respecting Diversity in Early Childhood Care, Education and Training*, Dublin: Pavee Point Publications, National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2005). *Intercultural Education in the Primary School: Guidelines for the Primary School*, Ireland: Government Publications. Dublin: DES

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2006). *Intercultural education in the post-primary school: enabling students to respect and celebrate diversity to promote equality and to challenge unfair discrimination*, Ireland: Government Publications.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2007). *Toolkit for Diversity in the Primary School*, Dublin: National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2008). *A Study of the Opportunities for Development Education at Senior Cycle*, Dublin: National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2018). *Education for Sustainable Development: A Study of Opportunities and Linkages in the Primary and Post-primary Curriculum*, Dublin: National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2009). *Aistear: The Early Childhood Curriculum Framework*, 2009, Dublin: National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.

Northern Ireland Museums Council (2006). *Our People, our times*, Belfast: Community Relations Council.

Open Method of Coordination (OMC) (2012). *Report on Policies and Good Practices in the Public Arts and in Cultural Institutions*. Brussels: European Union.

Open Method of Coordination (OMC) (2014). *Report on the Role of Public Arts and Cultural Institutions in the Promotion of Cultural Diversity and Intercultural Dialogue*. Brussels: European Union.

Open Method of Coordination (OMC) (2015). *Cultural Awareness and Expression Handbook*, Brussels: European Union.

Oxfam (2006). Education for Global Citizenship: A Guide for Schools, Oxford: Oxfam.

Parker-Jenkins, M. and Materson, M. (2013). No Longer Catholic, White and Gaelic: schools in Ireland coming to terms with cultural diversity, *Irish Educational Studies*, 32:4, pp.477-492.

Pike, G. and Selby, D., eds. (1998). *Global Teacher, Global Learner*, London: Hodder and Stoughton.

Regan, C. and Sinclair, S., eds. (1999). *Essential Learning for Everyone: Raising the Debate about Civil Society, World Citizenship, and the Role of Education*, Birmingham: Development Education Centre and Ireland: 80:20 Educating and Acting for a Better World.

Siung, J. (2020). 'Exploring World Faiths in Museum Collections: The Example from the Chester Beatty Library', in J. Norton-Wright (ed.), *Curating Islamic Art Worldwide: From Malacca to Manchester*, Heritage Studies in the Muslim World series, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, pp.135-143.

Siung, J. (2021). 'Discovering World Cultures through Chester Beatty's Collections for primary schools', in S. Shaffer (ed.), *International Thinking on Children in Museums, A sociocultural view of practice*, Global Perspectives on Children in Museums series, New York: Routledge Press, New York, pp.187-198.

Siung, J. (2011). 'Renegotiating Irish Identity: the Chester Beatty Library and Ireland', in Y.-T. Chang, and S. MacLeod (eds.), *Building Identity: The Making of National Museums and Identity Politics*, Taiwan: National Museum of History Taiwan, pp.77-89.

Tormey, R. (2003). *Teaching Social Justice. Intercultural and Development Education Perspectives on Education's Context, Content and Methods*, Limerick: Centre for Educational Disadvantage Research.

Tormey, R. and Gleeson, J. (2012). Irish post-primary students' attitudes towards ethnic minorities. *Irish Educational Studies*, pp.1–17.

Ubuntu Network. *Guidelines on Development Education on School Placement.* Limerick: Irish Aid.

Ubuntu Network (2016). *Strategic Plan 2016–2020: A Partnership Approach to Development Education in ITE*, Limerick: Ubuntu Network.

UNESCO (2005). UNESCO Guidelines on Intercultural Education, France: Education Sector.

Whitaker, T. and Kenny, M. (2016). Assessing Students' Journeys From Theory To Practice In Intercultural Education. *AISHE-J*, vol. 8, 2, pp.2551–25521.

Credits

Special thanks to our funders Creative Ireland and Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission.

Thanks to Dr Patricia Kieran, Clodagh Daly, Isabel Russell, Prof Aislinn O'Donnell, Jo Anne Sunderland Bowe and to the Education Department team Justyna Chmielewska and Dr Heidi Campbell.

Thanks to Lorelei Harris, who mentored us throughout the project.

We cannot go without saying a thank you to our volunteer guides, as well as to the teachers and students and their parents from Community National Schools and Larkin College Drimnagh for working with us during the project.

Ashbourne County Dublin, CNS Faughart Dundalk, CNS Lecarrow CNS, Roscommon Scoil Cormaic CNS Saggart and City West CNS

Finally, thanks to the Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Director Ms Fionnuala Croke and colleagues of the Chester Beatty for all of their support throughout the project.

© Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin



Clár Éire Ildánach Creative Ireland Programme 2017–2022





Colmisiún na hÉireann um Chearta an Duine agus Comhionannas Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission

Cover: Students from Community National School Saggart and City West, Tour of the galleries, © Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin